Evaluation of Pumper Specifications

On 25 March 2014, the apparatus committee was established to make suggestions for apparatus and equipment for future purchases using the SPLOST revenue. We had our first meeting on 14 May 2014 to establish our goals and responsibilities. Throughout the last two years, the committee has had several meetings, attended equipment demos and shows, apparatus demos, and hundreds of hours of research has been completed to make sure we are good stewards of the tax payers money and that we can continue to provide them with the best possible service. On 19 December 2014, the committee sent out a "wish list" to all employees. This list was reviewed and debated. The requests were incorporated into a preliminary specification. On 11 March 2016 the bid specifications were given back to us to review. On 21 March 2016 the bid specifications were accepted by and given back to Mr. Vaughn with the recommendation to change the year model to 2017. The bid was open for proposals and was concluded on 27 April 2016. The committee has received the bid proposals and specifications. These are our findings:

Rosenbauer, Pierce and Ferrara were eliminated due to the lack of a Spartan Chassis.

Marion and Smeal were the two bid proposals evaluated in depth.

Page 26 of the Gordon County Bid proposal Revision #1 states:

Gordon County places a high priority on the ability (of) the dealer to provide post-sales service of the proposed apparatus. To ensure the successful bidder has the capability and qualifications to service and repair emergency vehicle(s), the following minimum requirements shall apply:

~~The bidder must have a brick and mortar service facility~~. Deleted

The bidder must offer mobile service to Gordon County, GA.

The dealer shall provide full-time service technicians with the following minimum certifications as part of your mobile service:

- *Master Level Emergency Vehicle Technicians (EVT)*
- *National Institute for Automotive Service Excellence (ASE)*
- *Apparatus Manufacturers Service School*

~~Photographs of the service center, as well as~~ Copies of the technician(s) certification(s) shall accompany the proposal. Proposals that do not comply with the minimum requirements of this section will not be considered.

Upon review of the Marion bid we were unable to locate any copies of certifications of the listed technicians Chuck Miller of Emergency Vehicle Technical Services or Randell Bracket of Randell Bracket Fire Truck Service.

Smeal provided the copies of certifications along with having 3 mobile service response units with 5 personnel.

Chassis Evaluation

Marion listed 12 clarifications and no exceptions in section 10 of the Gordon County Bid Proposal.

Smeal listed 10 clarifications and 4 exceptions in section 10 of the Gordon County Bid Proposal.

Page 23 of the Gordon County Bid Proposal Revision #1 states:

The chassis, pump, and body specifications shall be strictly adhered to. Exceptions shall be allowed if they are equal to or superior to that specified (as judged by the customer), and provided they are listed and fully explained. Exception lists shall refer to the specification page number. ***(see attached specification document)***

PROPOSALS TAKING TOTAL EXCEPTION TO THESE SPECIFICATIONS WILL BE IMMEDIATELY REJECTED.

The buyer is aware that all bidders shall have to take some exception therefore; BIDDERS THAT TAKE NO EXCEPTIONS shall BE REQUIRED TO MEET EVERY PARAGRAPH TO THE FULLEST EXTENT SHOULD THEIR BID BE ACCEPTED.

It is the intent of the purchaser to receive bids that do not require telephone calls or other communications to ascertain what a bidder is intending to supply.

Deviations shall not be acceptable unless they were noted as exceptions at the time of bid and the apparatus shall be rejected until said deviations are corrected to the satisfaction of the buyer.

Decisions regarding equal to or better than, shall be the sole responsibility of the recipient of the bids rather than those companies submitting bids. All deviations, regardless of significance must be explained in the "EXCEPTIONS TO SPECIFICATIONS" section of the bid.

When exceptions are not taken but inconsistencies are noted in the submitted detailed specifications, the bid may be subject to rejection.

Upon evaluation of the Marion proposal, there were 31 inconsistencies/variations to the Spartan Chassis portion of the proposal. 7 of those were outlined in the clarifications/exceptions section of the bid.

We understand that some of the inconsistencies were used to help us "save money" or "better suit" us. However, that prevents us from comparing two like apparatus. We did not ask for these changes. Those changes should be suggested at the pre-construction meeting.

Page 10 of the Gordon County Bid Proposal Revision #1 states:

There shall be a pre-construction meeting held at the apparatus manufacturer's factory. Up to three (3) fire department personnel, dealer representative(s) and factory representative(s) shall be present during the pre-construction meeting process. The purpose of conducting this meeting at the factory is to allow the fire department personnel to see various features of or similar components on other apparatus that may be found on the production floor. The pre-construction meeting is the most important meeting during the after-sale production process. The purpose of this meeting is to finalize all aspects of the specifications, discuss and clarify all design details of the apparatus, and to share or provide all information so all parties are in agreement on the apparatus being constructed. The ultimate goal of the pre-construction meeting is for the fire department officials, dealer representative(s), and factory representative(s) to discuss and clarify all aspects of the proposed apparatus and to

provide all necessary information to the apparatus manufacturer that will ensure the apparatus is built to the satisfaction of all parties involved.

The specifications were made to compare apparatus, not to suggest changes.

Since Marion and Smeal both have to order the Chassis from Spartan, there should be no differences in this portion of the proposal.

<u>Inconsistencies/Variations of the Spartan Chassis from Marion (Gordon County page # Marion page #)</u>

Wheel Base is 193” instead of 195” GC17 M20

Overall Length is 394” instead of 398” GC17 M Drawing

Cab Paint Interior was changed GC22 M4

5 speed Transmission instead of the 6 speed GC32 M11

Front Tire sizes changed GC39 M16

Rear Axle Ratio of 5.13:1 instead of 5.63:1 GC39 M17

Accuride Brand front and rear wheels instead of Alcoa Brand GC40 M17

Automatic Traction Control System and switch was left out. GC41 M18

Brake size is a 8.63” instead of 7.0” GC41 M18

Battery is 925 CCA instead of 950 CCA GC62 M33

Rear Brake Chambers are 30/30 instead of 30/36 which gives 30” of effective area instead of 36” GC42 M19

Proposed Manual Drain Valves instead of Automatic and Manual GC43 M19

Added an air inlet connection GC-- M20

Added an air outlet connection GC-- M20

Proposed a 2084 cu.in air tank instead of 1200 cu.in. GC46 M22

The cab tilt receptacle was placed in the bumper instead of behind the cab GC48 M23

Middle side glass was left out GC49 M24

2 12v power points instead of 1 GC52 M26

Seat material was changed to durable ballistic polyester instead of “Turnout Tuff” material GC55 M29

Driver seat was changed. Seats 911 was replaced with Bostrom GC56 M29

Driver Seat adjustment was changed from electric to manual GC56 M29

Officer seat was changed. Seats 911 was replaced with Bostrom GC57 M30

Officer Seat adjustment was changed from electric to manual GC57 M30

Officer Seat SCBA bracket was changed from Ziamatic brand to Secure All brand GC57 M30

Crew Seats were changed. Seats 911 was replaced with Bostrom GC58 M31

Crew Seat SCBA brackets were changed from Ziamatic brand to Secure All brand GC58 M31

Seat Box was 42.38” wide instead of 62.38” wide GC58 M31

Seats were mounted 2.25” apart instead of 16” apart GC59 M32

Battery display was placed under the windshield instead of over the wheel well GC63 M34

Electrical Inlet (Kussmaul) was placed in the lower front step instead of over the wheel well GC64 M35

Overhead Lights were changed to LED GC65 M36

7 of the 31 above inconsistencies/deviations were listed in the exceptions portion of the Bid Proposal.

<u>Inconsistencies/Variations of the Spartan Chassis from Smeal(Gordon County page # Smeal page #)</u>

Overall Length is 396” instead of 398” GC 17 S 1

Cab Paint Interior was changed GC 22 S 6

Front Tire sizes changed GC 39 S 22

Front Wheel sizes changed GC 40 S 23

Battery has 925 CCA instead of 950 GC 62 S 44

Overhead Lights were changed to LED GC 65 S 47-48

Electronic Siren Speaker Location was moved to center GC 46-47 S 30

7 of the 7 above inconsistencies/deviations were listed in the exceptions portion of the bid proposal.

Due to the proprietary building processes of Marion there are going to be Inconsistencies/Variations that cannot be helped. As a committee, we understand and have taken them into consideration.

The Marion proposal did not follow the order of the bid, so page numbers will jump around.

Inconsistencies/Variations of the Pumper Body from Marion (Gordon County page # Marion page #)

States that a Waterous CSU pump will be used. Spec requires CSU C20. GC98 M5

Pump transmission model is not specified. Spec requires C20 series GC98 M6

Trident Priming Pump model was not specified. Spec requires model 31.001.7 GC101 M7

Pump and Engine Cooling System is auxiliary system GC101 M7

Master Drain Valve is not specified. Spec requires Trident Manifold Drain Valve GC101 M7

Class One Intake Relief valve instead of Elkhart Brass GC101 M8

8800 valves <4" & 8840 valves>4" Spec lists 8815,8820,8825,8830 & 8840 GC110-117 M8

Crossfire XFC-52 instead XFT-NJ also added Extend a gun assembly GC118 M10

Auxiliary Foam Inlet and pick up tube not included GC103 M13

Tank to Pump valve is 3" not 3.5" GC108 GC14

Hose wells did not specify holding 33' of 5" with storz connection GC95 M15

Valve controls were not specified as Akron R1 GC108-117 M16

Pump Panel Lighting is Tecniq instead of On Scene Night Axe GC97 M16

Pump panel ID plates brand was not specified GC97 M16

Water Level Indicator light is Innovative Controls 14 LED light instead of SL Plus Tank Level Monitor System 16 LED GC77 M17

Foam Level Indicator light is Innovative Controls 14 LED light instead of SL Plus Tank Level Monitor System 16 LED GC78 M18

Water tank made of PT3 instead of PT2E GC75 M18

Tank Mounting rests on cross members instead of cradled in sub frame GC77 M19

Foam Tank is Integral Poly III instead of UPF GC78 M19

Hose bed floor is 1/8" aluminum instead of 3/16" Dura Dek poly coated Fiber board GC79-80 M20

Hose bed dividers are .18" thick aluminum instead of .25" thick aluminum GC80 M20

Hose bed cover is waterproof vinyl instead of 22oz Hypalon vinyl coated nylon GC80 M20

Hose bed cover fastens with bungees instead of button snaps on the sides and buckles on the back GC80 M20

Compartment vents are stamped holes instead of rubber gaskets GC83 M22

Mateflex grating is used in compartment floors instead of turtle tile plastics GC82 M23

4 access rails instead of 5 GC83 M25

Paint uses Delfleet Evolution instead of DelFleet High Solids Polyurethane. No mention of Clear coat GC128 M25

Pump Compartment was left unpainted GC101 M26

Pump was not painted GC101 M26

Compartment Finish is spatter type coating instead of Line-X GC82 M26

Undercoating is 1 step Ztech ZPG1015 instead of 2 step rubberized polyurethane base compound covered by bituminous based automotive undercoating GC129 M26

Reflective Material is Scotchlite instead of 3M Diamond Grade VIP reflective striping GC130 M26-27

Compartment L1 is 5”taller 4” wider 1” deeper on the lower and 2” shallower on the upper

Compartment L2 is 4.5” taller 8”narrower and 2” shallower

Compartment L3 is 5” taller 2”narrower 71” shallower on the lower and 2” shallower on the upper

Compartment R1 is 5”taller 4” wider 1” deeper on the lower and 2” shallower on the upper

Compartment R2 is 4.5” taller 8”narrower and 2” shallower

Compartment R3 is 5” taller 2”narrower 71” shallower on the lower and 2” shallower on the upper

Compartment T1 is 0” taller 1”wider and 8”shallower GC83-89 M28

SCBA wheel well storage is different GC85-88 M28

Wheel well storage doors are treadplate instead of Stainless steel GC85-88 M28

Body is hardwired instead V-Mux Deutsch connectors GC119-120 M30

Telescoping Scene Lights are model FCA530-V15 (15,000 lumens) instead of SPA530-Q20 (20,000 lumens) GC127 M32

Ground Lights are Tecniq T41 instead of Truck Lite model 44 GC122 M33

Fire Com headsets were 2-UH-51 & 2-UH-52 instead of 1-UH-51S, 1-UH-51, & 2-Uh-52 GC123 M33

Whelen Beacon lights are both Red instead of 1 being Amber GC123 M34

Wheel Chocks are Worden HGS instead of ZICO SAC-44

5 of the 47 above inconsistencies/deviations were listed in the exceptions portion of the Bid Proposal.

Inconsistencies/Variations of the Pumper Body from Smeal (Gordon County page # Smeal page #)

Compartment L3 is 40" wide instead of 48" GC85 S67

2 additional folding steps were added to the rear GC93 S74

Model F4X7R0R0 lightbar was used instead of FN72VLED GC123 S104

3 of the 3 above inconsistencies/deviations were listed in the exceptions portion of the Bid Proposal.

Facts:

The specifications were written by Smeal, but both Companies have to purchase the chassis from Spartan and should have the same options no matter who orders it.

Since 2014 Smeal advised us of a 6% increase on the engine. (3% at Spartan and 3% at Smeal) 425,000.00 x 6% is 450,500.00. I believe that is where the initial difference in price is.

The specifications were written to have companies propose apparatus as close to what we want as possible. The pre-construction meeting is where options are cut or added.

There would have to be a lot changed to the Marion proposal in order to make a sound determination of what truck would serve us and the community best.

Pricing is continued on next page.

Pricing

Marion gave a price of $431,183.00 per truck. Marion requires Gordon County to pay for the chassis upon delivery to Marion.

Smeal gave a price of $457,507.00 per truck with an additional $5,642.00 deduction if Gordon County pays for the chassis upon delivery to Smeal. That brings the comparable price to $451,865.00.

That is a difference of $20,682.00

We feel that the difference in price is justified by the inconsistencies and deviations in the above analysis of the Marion proposal. It would cost approximately $20,000.00 or more to make the Marion equivalent to the specifications Gordon County asked for.

Another factor we took into consideration is the performance and cost of ownership of our newest pumper, which is a 2004 Smeal.

The committee unanimously agreed that Smeal should be awarded the contract for Gordon County's new pumpers.